

## Review of

Occurrence of structural aluminium (Al) in marine diatom biological silica: Visible evidence from microscopic analysis by Tian et al.,

The revised version has clearly improved compared to the first version.

However, a few points remain.

## Abstract:

Line 25/26: This is not the first time, as Gehlen et al and Beck et al already gave evidence for structural Al in BSi. The main point in this study is in my view, that it was shown that Al is found throughout the BSi, suggesting a direct link between Al incorporation and Si incorporation.

## Introduction:

L38. I suggest to split the sentence into two sentences.

L69: Misspelling of Gehlen

L72: This was not speculated but shown

L73: I suggest transfer instead of migration

## M&M

L96: Composition is (not are)

L 103: the initial Al concentration is not mentioned (but indicated in the reply) and should be mentioned here.

## Results

L198/L211: Here, the structural evidence by Gehlen et al and Beck et al. should be discussed in more detail and their evidence of structural Al based on the coordination of Al and Si should be mentioned in the text. Also, it should be pointed out that in the measurements from cultures, naturally occurring Al/si containing minerals do not play a role.

L230: the Al/Si should be 0.011, not 0.11? Also mention, that the ratio is based on the FIB treated BSi