

Interactive comment on “Australian tidal currents – assessment of a barotropic model with an unstructured grid” by David A. Griffin et al.

Katsuro Katsumata (Editor)

k.katsumata@jamstec.go.jp

Received and published: 26 January 2021

Both reviewers do not recommend publication of the present manuscript due to its lack of scientific contents. The authors summarized the arguments with a question: "whether papers like ours should only exist as technical reports, or whether they should be peer-reviewed alongside studies of dynamics."

I think the question is valid, but I am not sure if the authors' choice for this particular journal, *Ocean Science*, is a good one. In this sense, I agree with Reviewer 2 that more scientific discussion is needed for OS. The "aims and scope" (https://www.ocean-science.net/about/aims_and_scope.html) states its "primary objective" to "publish a very high-quality *scientific* journal" (emphasis added).

C1

There are other, peer-reviewed, journals dedicated to technical and/or methodological discussion (e.g. <https://www.geoscientific-model-development.net/>).

I looked up recent accepted papers on *Ocean Science* which appear to focus on technical discussion of numerical models. These papers often introduce new methods (Crocker et al., 2020; Sun et al., 2021; Zujev et al., 2021), put emphasis on physics (Wekerle et al., 2020), or global (Heuzé, 2021; Carrere et al., 2021). The present manuscript does not appear to fall into any of these categories. I understand this regional model is applicable to global coastal oceans but the link is not obvious in the present form.

I therefore recommend the authors to find another journal for this manuscript and do not encourage revision for *Ocean Science*.

Carrere et al., 2021 Accuracy assessment of global internal-tide models using satellite altimetry, doi:10.5194/os-17-147-2021

Crocker et al., 2020, An approach to the verification of high-resolution ocean models using spatial methods, doi:10.5194/os-16-831-2020

Heuzé, 2021 Antarctic Bottom Water and North Atlantic Deep Water in CMIP6 models, doi:10.5194/os-17-59-2021

Sun et al., 2021 A clustering-based approach to ocean model-data comparison around Antarctica, doi:10.5194/os-17-131-2021

Wekerle et al., 2020 Properties and dynamics of mesoscale eddies in Fram Strait from a comparison between two high-resolution ocean-sea ice models, doi:10.5194/os-16-1225-2020

Zujev et al., 2021 Data assimilation of sea surface temperature and salinity using basin-scale reconstruction from empirical orthogonal functions: a feasibility study in the northeastern Baltic Sea, doi:10.5194/os-17-91-2021

C2

