Ocean Science

Discussions

Open Access

EGU

Interactive comment on "Influence of the summer deep-sea circulations on passive drifts among the submarine canyons in the northwestern Mediterranean Sea" *by* Morane Clavel-Henry et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 23 September 2019

This paper examines connectivity of bottom spawned larvae between submarine canyons. The value to fisheries lies in optimal scaling of management regions. The introduction sets a clear rationale for the study. The methodology section is thorough and detailed, presenting two models which will be used with varying parameterizations. The results give a clear number for connectivity.

However, I am reluctant to trust models without in-situ validation. In my experience with modeling, I am convinced that models are principally to be used as tools to guide further study. But I am also aware that the complexity of details that can be achieved by models may not presently be amenable to validation.

C1

The conclusion section is rather lame compared to the rest of the paper and contains poor English phrasing. My recommendation is that the conclusions be given more effort. Since fishery managers tend to believe models, I recommend that you make some effort at dissuading them that model details are not substitutes for accuracy. For example, a 4th order Runge Kutta with added sub-grid scale turbulence is still uncertain.

Interactive comment on Ocean Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/os-2019-61, 2019.