**Ocean Science
Discussions**

Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on "A discussion on the use of X-band SAR images in marine applications" *by* D. Schiavulli et al.

Anonymous Referee #3

Received and published: 27 February 2013

The paper by Schiavulli et al. attempts to discuss limitations of currently available X-band SAR acquisitions for marine applications. The paper must be understood as a review paper, since no new scientific results are presented.

The text extensively deals with two effects that distort SAR images and consequently affect marine applications: (1) the presence of hydrometeors in rain cells that modify microwave radiation, and (2) the scalloping effect. Other potential environmental effects or system-inherent limitations are neither mentioned nor rated in terms of their potential impact on the usability of SAR images for marine applications. Moreover, the authors restrict themselves to give a summary of previous papers for the two effects they are discussing, making it virtually impossible to learn about the fundamentals of any of the methods suggested from the present text alone.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper

Since, moreover, the paper almost exclusively discusses those two effects for the X-Band, which only a minority of currently operating satellites is using, I believe the presented material is to narrow in scope to justify the acceptance of this text as a review paper. I therefore recommend to reject the paper in its present form, but eventually to ask the authors to re-submit an extended version of their text that covers the limitations for marine applications from a more general point-of-view.

Interactive comment on Ocean Sci. Discuss., 9, 3239, 2012.

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper