



Interactive
Comment

Interactive comment on “Coastal upwelling along the southwest coast of India – ENSOmodulation”

by K. Muni Krishna

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 28 April 2008

Resumee

From the well-known facts that ENSO modulates the Indian Monsoon, and that the Monsoon impacts coastal upwelling along the south Indian coast, the author hypothesizes that there should be an ENSO-upwelling teleconnection. As upwelling impacts fisheries this would be important to know. The anticipated time-lag would imply some form of predictability. He then tests his hypothesis by correlationg an ENSO index with SST anomalies (SSTA) of the south-west Indoan coast and finds that indeed ENSO is a good predictor for SSTAs off the Indian coast a few months later.

The paper is short and concisely written and contains all necessary information.

Unfortunately, it also contains a major methodological flaw. When assessing the hind-

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



cast skill (p. 127) for the years 1997/98 and 1989/99, the author uses a regression that has been derived from the period 1960-2003, i.e., in which the years to be tested are included. This is thus no independent test. The test must be repeated with the two years to be tested removed from the period over which the relation is derived.

OSD

5, S6–S7, 2008

Interactive
Comment

Recommendation

My recommendation is therefore *accept with major revision*, and contingent on the positive result being confirmed by the revised test.

Typos etc

Numbers denote page/line numbers.

125/15: AS -> As

126/21: off southwest coast"-> of the southwest coast; this error occurs all over the place.

126/21: indicating -> indicate

126/23: also good -> also a good

128/1: relaxed -> reduced

128/26: modulated -> modulate

Figure 2: "bold" and "dot" must be reversed in the legend; it would be helpful to have the regression and/or correlation values added.

Interactive comment on Ocean Sci. Discuss., 5, 123, 2008.

[Full Screen / Esc](#)

[Printer-friendly Version](#)

[Interactive Discussion](#)

[Discussion Paper](#)

